

THE WRITING ACADEMY®

# Assessment Companion

Grade 5 · Cluster 4

ECR: Argumentative

---

Passage: The Garden That Wouldn't Grow

**Grade 5 Assessment Companion: Cluster 4**

© 2026 The Writing Academy®, LLC. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of the publisher.

The Writing Academy® is a registered trademark of The Writing Academy, LLC.

# Module 1 · Building the Argumentative Foundation

Claim, Reasons, and Evidence

C L U S T E R 4 · M O D U L E 1 · M O D U L E A S S E S S M E N T M A P

## What to Assess This Week

|                             |                                                                                        |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>ASSESSMENT TARGET</b>    | State a claim, give reasons, and support with evidence from the text.                  |
| <b>STANDARDS</b>            | 5.11B(v) organize 5.11C(i-v) develop 5.12C(i) claim 5.12C(ii) evidence                 |
| <b>RPLD STAGE THIS WEEK</b> | Emergent to Visible: students NOTICE how a claim differs from a thesis (central idea). |
| <b>EVIDENCE TYPE</b>        | Daily Learning Artifact: a claim + one reason + evidence.                              |

## Three Ways to Gather the Evidence

### Path A : Quick Check

The 5-question Multiple-Choice Check on claims and evidence.

### Path A : Application Artifact

Student writes a claim with one reason and evidence.

### Path C : Choice Demonstration

Student may map, say, or write: same target, same scoring.

**Grade the target, not everything. Grade whether the claim takes a position and the reason supports it.**

**Multiple-Choice Check**

Five questions on this module's target: building a claim with reasons and evidence.

***The Garden That Wouldn't Grow***

"The Garden That Wouldn't Grow." Kendrix enjoyed spending time in her grandmother's garden. Each spring, they carefully planted tomatoes, peppers, and herbs in neat rows. It was something they looked forward to every year. However, this season, the plants did not grow as expected. After two weeks, Kendrix noticed that the plants appeared weak. Their leaves were pale instead of a healthy green, and several stems were beginning to droop. (Paired with "Words That Changed a Nation," about the Declaration of Independence.)

*Grade 5, Cluster 4 (Scope & Sequence). Students build argumentative ECRs with claims, reasons, evidence, and rebuttals using the CREATURES framework.*

**1. Which sentence is a CLAIM about the garden passage?**

- A. Gardens have plants.
- B. Kendrix should test soil before planting because it prevents wasted time and lost crops.
- C. Dirt is brown.
- D. Grandmothers like flowers.

**2. Which fact BEST supports this claim?**

- A. The passage states that after Kendrix tested the soil and added compost, the plants recovered.
- B. Gardens are pretty.
- C. Peppers are spicy.
- D. Spring is a season.

**3. Which sentence is the BEST claim for an argumentative ECR?**

- A. I think gardens are nice.
- B. Plants grow.
- C. Evidence and research are the best tools for solving problems because they replace guessing with understanding.
- D. Soil exists.

**4. Which sentence does NOT belong?**

- A. Testing soil prevents problems.
- B. My favorite color is blue.
- C. Compost adds nutrients.
- D. Research leads to solutions.

**5. Which sentence has correct subject-verb agreement?**

- A. The plants grows better.
- B. The plants grow better.
- C. The plants growing better.
- D. The plants was grow better.

Purpose: a quick, gradeable check of 5.11B(v) organize. Administration: ~10 minutes, independent. Scoring: 5 points (1 each); Answer Key & Error Analysis on the next page.

## Answer Key & Error Analysis

**Not just the right answer : what a wrong choice reveals, and what to do about it.**

### 1. Claim

**Correct: B**

The claim takes a position (test soil first). The others are facts or opinions.

### 2. Best evidence

**Correct: A**

The evidence proves the claim (testing + compost = recovery).

### 3. Best claim

**Correct: C**

The claim names a position the ECR can argue.

### 4. Does not belong

**Correct: B**

A color preference is irrelevant.

### 5. Agreement

**Correct: B**

"grow" agrees with plural "plants."

**Questions 1 or 3 missed widely: practice distinguishing claims from facts.**

## Exemplars &amp; Rubric

**Prompt:** "Write a claim about "The Garden That Wouldn't Grow" with one reason and one piece of evidence." 5.12C(i)

- 4** *"Kendrix's garden shows that evidence and research are the best tools for solving problems. The passage explains that after she tested the soil and added compost, the plants recovered. This proves that understanding the cause, not just guessing, leads to a real solution."*  
 SECURE: claim + reason + evidence + explanation · RPLD: Independent

- 3** *"Testing the soil helped the garden because Kendrix found out it needed nutrients."*  
 DEMONSTRATES: claim + reason, lighter · RPLD: Visible

- 2** *"The garden had problems."*  
 DEVELOPING: fact, no position · RPLD: Emergent · Next: take a position

- 1** *"Garden."*  
 BEGINNING: topic only · RPLD: Foundational · Next: model a claim

This four-point scale scores the claim + reason + evidence.

## TEACHER SCRIPT : EXPLAINING THIS TASK TO STUDENTS

**SAY**

"A CLAIM takes a position. It is not just a fact. What position does Kendrix's story support?"

**SAY**

"'The garden had problems' is a fact. 'Testing the soil is the best first step' is a claim."

► Students write a claim, then add one reason and one piece of evidence.

" " = say word-for-word · ► = teacher direction (do not read aloud)

# Module 2 · Turning Parts into a Coherent Argument

Connecting claim, reasons, and thinking

C L U S T E R 4 · M O D U L E 2 · M O D U L E A S S E S S M E N T M A P

## What to Assess This Week

|                      |                                                                                  |
|----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ASSESSMENT TARGET    | Connect the claim, reasons, and evidence into a coherent line of argument.       |
| STANDARDS            | 5.11B(v) organize 5.11C(i-ii) develop 5.11C(v) develop 5.12C(i-ii) argumentative |
| RPLD STAGE THIS WEEK | Visible: students CONNECT the parts into a line of argument.                     |
| EVIDENCE TYPE        | Daily Learning Artifact: claim + two connected reasons with evidence.            |

### Three Ways to Gather the Evidence

**Path A : Quick Check**

The 5-question Multiple-Choice Check on coherent arguments.

**Path A : Application Artifact**

Student writes two reasons connected to the claim with evidence.

**Path C : Choice Demonstration**

Same target, same scoring.

Grade the target, not everything. Grade whether the reasons connect to the claim.

**Multiple-Choice Check**

Five questions on coherent argument building.

***The Garden That Wouldn't Grow***

"The Garden That Wouldn't Grow." Kendrix enjoyed spending time in her grandmother's garden. Each spring, they carefully planted tomatoes, peppers, and herbs in neat rows. It was something they looked forward to every year. However, this season, the plants did not grow as expected. After two weeks, Kendrix noticed that the plants appeared weak. Their leaves were pale instead of a healthy green, and several stems were beginning to droop. (Paired with "Words That Changed a Nation," about the Declaration of Independence.)

*Grade 5, Cluster 4 (Scope & Sequence). Students build argumentative ECRs with claims, reasons, evidence, and rebuttals using the CREATURES framework.*

**1. Which transition BEST connects a reason to a claim?**

- A. However
- B. One reason this matters is
- C. But
- D. Instead

**2. Which sentence shows the STRONGEST thinking?**

- A. Kendrix's experience demonstrates that evidence-based problem solving produces lasting results.
- B. She did a thing.
- C. Gardens are nice.
- D. Stuff happened.

**3. Which revision UPGRADES "She fixed it"?**

- A. She fixed it a lot.
- B. She fixed stuff.
- C. After researching the problem, Kendrix added compost that restored the soil's nutrients.
- D. She fixed the thing.

**4. Which word is spelled correctly?**

- A. nutrents
- B. nutriants
- C. nutrients
- D. nutrents

**5. Which sentence correctly uses a comma in a compound sentence?**

- A. Kendrix tested the soil, and she added compost.
- B. Kendrix tested the soil and, she added compost.
- C. Kendrix, tested the soil and she added compost.
- D. Kendrix tested, the soil and she added compost.

Purpose: a quick, gradeable check of 5.11B(v) organize. Administration: ~10 minutes, independent. Scoring: 5 points (1 each); Answer Key & Error Analysis on the next page.

## Answer Key & Error Analysis

**Not just the right answer : what a wrong choice reveals, and what to do about it.**

### 1. Transition

**Correct: B**

"One reason this matters is" introduces a supporting reason.

### 2. Strongest thinking

**Correct: A**

"demonstrates that evidence-based problem solving produces lasting results" is precise.

### 3. Upgrade

**Correct: C**

The upgrade names the specific action and result.

### 4. Spelling

**Correct: C**

"nutrients" is correct.

### 5. Comma

**Correct: A**

Comma before "and" joins two independent clauses.

**Questions 1 or 2 missed widely: practice connecting reasons to claims.**

## Exemplars & Rubric

**Prompt:** “Write two reasons that support your claim about evidence-based problem solving, with evidence from the passage.” 5.12C(ii)

**4** *“One reason evidence matters is that guessing kept the garden failing. The passage shows Kendrix’s plants stayed weak until she tested the soil. Another reason is that the solution lasted. After she added compost based on her findings, the plants recovered and grew strong.”*  
 SECURE: two connected reasons with evidence · RPLD: Independent

**3** *“Testing helped because she found the problem. Compost fixed it.”*  
 DEMONSTRATES: two reasons, lighter · RPLD: Visible

**2** *“She fixed the garden.”*  
 DEVELOPING: one vague reason · RPLD: Emergent · Next: explain WHY

**1** *“Compost.”*  
 BEGINNING: no argument · RPLD: Foundational · Next: model connecting reason to claim

This four-point scale scores the two connected reasons.

## TEACHER SCRIPT : EXPLAINING THIS TASK TO STUDENTS

### SAY

“Your reasons should connect back to the claim like branches to a tree.”

### SAY

“Each reason needs evidence from the text. Without evidence, a reason is just a claim inside a claim.”

► Students write two reasons, each with at least one piece of text evidence.

“ ” = say word-for-word · ► = teacher direction (do not read aloud)

# Module 3 · Understanding Others and Building a Rebuttal

Address what others might think

C L U S T E R 4 · M O D U L E 3 · M O D U L E A S S E S S M E N T M A P

## What to Assess This Week

|                             |                                                                                       |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>ASSESSMENT TARGET</b>    | Acknowledge an opposing view and write a rebuttal supported by evidence.              |
| <b>STANDARDS</b>            | 5.11B(iii) acknowledge 5.11B(v) organize 5.11C(vi) rebuttal 5.12C(i-ii) argumentative |
| <b>RPLD STAGE THIS WEEK</b> | Independent: students ADDRESS counterarguments.                                       |
| <b>EVIDENCE TYPE</b>        | Daily Learning Artifact: one opposing view + rebuttal with evidence.                  |

## Three Ways to Gather the Evidence

### Path A : Quick Check

The 5-question Multiple-Choice Check on rebuttals.

### Path A : Application Artifact

Student writes an opposing view and a rebuttal.

### Path C : Choice Demonstration

Same target, same scoring.

**Grade the target, not everything. Grade whether the student acknowledges the other side and responds with evidence.**

**Multiple-Choice Check**

Five questions on understanding others and building rebuttals.

***The Garden That Wouldn't Grow***

"The Garden That Wouldn't Grow." Kendrix enjoyed spending time in her grandmother's garden. Each spring, they carefully planted tomatoes, peppers, and herbs in neat rows. It was something they looked forward to every year. However, this season, the plants did not grow as expected. After two weeks, Kendrix noticed that the plants appeared weak. Their leaves were pale instead of a healthy green, and several stems were beginning to droop. (Paired with "Words That Changed a Nation," about the Declaration of Independence.)

*Grade 5, Cluster 4 (Scope & Sequence). Students build argumentative ECRs with claims, reasons, evidence, and rebuttals using the CREATURES framework.*

**1. Which sentence acknowledges an opposing view?**

- A. Testing soil is always right.
- B. Some people might argue that Kendrix should have simply watered the plants more.
- C. Gardens are easy.
- D. Everyone agrees with testing.

**2. Which sentence is a strong REBUTTAL?**

- A. I disagree.
- B. However, the passage shows that the problem was a lack of nutrients, not water, so extra watering would not have solved it.
- C. No.
- D. That is wrong.

**3. Which transition BEST introduces a rebuttal?**

- A. For example
- B. However, the evidence shows
- C. And also
- D. Next

**4. Which sentence is spelled correctly?**

- A. The evidance proves the clame.
- B. The evidence proves the claim.
- C. The evidince prooves the clam.
- D. The evidanse proovs the claime.

**5. Which sentence correctly uses quotation marks for a title?**

- A. The Garden That Wouldn't Grow
- B. "The Garden That Wouldn't Grow"
- C. The "Garden" That Wouldn't Grow
- D. "The" Garden That Wouldn't Grow

Purpose: a quick, gradeable check of 5.11B(iii) acknowledge. Administration: ~10 minutes, independent. Scoring: 5 points (1 each); Answer Key & Error Analysis on the next page.

## Answer Key & Error Analysis

**Not just the right answer : what a wrong choice reveals, and what to do about it.**

### 1. Opposing view

**Correct: B**

The correct sentence names what someone else might argue.

### 2. Rebuttal

**Correct: B**

The rebuttal uses evidence to disprove the opposing view.

### 3. Transition

**Correct: B**

"However, the evidence shows" introduces the rebuttal.

### 4. Spelling

**Correct: B**

"evidence" and "claim" are correct.

### 5. Quotation marks

**Correct: B**

Titles of passages are set in quotation marks.

**Questions 1 or 2 missed widely: practice acknowledging the other side before rebutting.**

## Exemplars &amp; Rubric

**Prompt:** "Write one opposing view and one rebuttal with evidence from the passage." 5.12C(ii)

**4** *"Some might argue that Kendrix should have just watered the plants more. However, the passage proves that the problem was a lack of nutrients in the soil, not a lack of water. After she tested the soil and added compost, the plants recovered, showing that understanding the real cause was the key."*

SECURE: opposing view + evidence-based rebuttal · RPLD: Independent

**3** *"Someone might say she should water more, but the passage shows it was about nutrients."*

DEMONSTRATES: opposing view + rebuttal, lighter · RPLD: Visible

**2** *"That is wrong."*

DEVELOPING: no opposing view or evidence · RPLD: Emergent · Next: name what someone else might think

**1** *"No."*

BEGINNING: not a rebuttal · RPLD: Foundational · Next: model the opposing-view/rebuttal pair

This four-point scale scores the opposing view + rebuttal.

## TEACHER SCRIPT : EXPLAINING THIS TASK TO STUDENTS

**SAY**

"Before you argue, show you understand the OTHER side. Then use evidence to respond."

**SAY**

"'Some might say...' names the other side. 'However, the passage shows...' is your rebuttal."

► Students write the opposing view, then the rebuttal with evidence. Conference after.

" " = say word-for-word · ► = teacher direction (do not read aloud)

# Module 4 · The Full Argumentative ECR

The independent argumentative response

C L U S T E R 4 · M O D U L E 4 · M O D U L E A S S E S S M E N T M A P

## What to Assess This Week

|                      |                                                                                             |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ASSESSMENT TARGET    | Write a complete argumentative ECR: claim, reasons with evidence, rebuttal, and conclusion. |
| STANDARDS            | 5.12C(i-ii) argumentative 5.11B structure 5.11C(i-vi) develop 5.11D(xxix) spelling          |
| RPLD STAGE THIS WEEK | Independent to Reflective: students OWN and DEFEND the full argument.                       |
| EVIDENCE TYPE        | Monthly-facing Module Evidence: the culminating argumentative ECR.                          |

### Three Ways to Gather the Evidence

**Path A : Quick Check**

The 5-question Multiple-Choice Check on the full argumentative ECR.

**Path A : Application Artifact**

Student writes the full argumentative ECR.

**Path C : Choice Demonstration**

Same target, same scoring.

This is the cluster's anchor evidence. Reward precise thinking, not length.

**Multiple-Choice Check**

Five questions on the full argumentative ECR.

***The Garden That Wouldn't Grow***

"The Garden That Wouldn't Grow." Kendrix enjoyed spending time in her grandmother's garden. Each spring, they carefully planted tomatoes, peppers, and herbs in neat rows. It was something they looked forward to every year. However, this season, the plants did not grow as expected. After two weeks, Kendrix noticed that the plants appeared weak. Their leaves were pale instead of a healthy green, and several stems were beginning to droop. (Paired with "Words That Changed a Nation," about the Declaration of Independence.)

*Grade 5, Cluster 4 (Scope & Sequence). Students build argumentative ECRs with claims, reasons, evidence, and rebuttals using the CREATURES framework.*

**1. Which is the BEST concluding sentence?**

- A. The end.
- B. I hope you agree.
- C. Dirt is important.
- D. Because Kendrix proved that testing the soil led to a real solution, her story shows that evidence and research are always stronger tools than guessing.

**2. Which sentence does NOT belong?**

- A. Evidence leads to better solutions.
- B. My brother likes video games.
- C. Testing the soil revealed the real problem.
- D. Compost restored the nutrients.

**3. Which sentence is spelled correctly?**

- A. The arguement was convinceing.
- B. The argument was convincing.
- C. The arguemint was convinceing.
- D. The argumant was convinving.

**4. Which sentence has correct subject-verb agreement?**

- A. The reasons supports the claim.
- B. The reasons support the claim.
- C. The reasons supporting the claim.
- D. The reasons was support the claim.

**5. Which order BEST organizes an argumentative ECR?**

- A. Random facts.
- B. Claim, reasons with evidence, a rebuttal, and a conclusion.
- C. One sentence.
- D. The rebuttal first, then the claim.

Purpose: a quick, gradeable check of 5.12C(i-ii) argumentative. Administration: ~10 minutes, independent. Scoring: 5 points (1 each); Answer Key & Error Analysis on the next page.

## Answer Key & Error Analysis

Not just the right answer : what a wrong choice reveals, and what to do about it.

### 1. Best conclusion

**Correct: D**

The conclusion restates the claim and its significance.

### 2. Does not belong

**Correct: B**

A hobby is irrelevant.

### 3. Spelling

**Correct: B**

"argument" and "convincing" are correct.

### 4. Agreement

**Correct: B**

"support" agrees with plural "reasons."

### 5. Organization

**Correct: B**

An argumentative ECR has claim, reasons, rebuttal, and conclusion.

**This is the anchor check. Widespread misses on 1 or 5: reteach argumentative structure.**

## Exemplars &amp; Rubric

**Prompt:** "In an argumentative ECR, argue whether evidence-based problem solving or guessing is a better way to solve problems. Use "The Garden That Wouldn't Grow" as evidence." 5.12C(i-ii)

**4** *"Evidence and research are always stronger tools than guessing when solving problems. Kendrix's garden failed until she stopped guessing and tested the soil. The passage explains that after she discovered the dirt lacked nutrients and added compost, the plants recovered. Some might argue that experience alone is enough, but Kendrix had planted before and still could not solve the problem until she used evidence. Because her research led to a lasting solution, her story proves that understanding the cause always beats hoping for the best."*

SECURE: claim + reasons + rebuttal + conclusion · RPLD: Independent

**3** *"Testing is better than guessing because Kendrix found the problem in the soil. She added compost and the garden grew. That shows evidence works."*

DEMONSTRATES: claim + evidence + conclusion, lighter · RPLD: Visible

**2** *"The garden had problems and she fixed it."*

DEVELOPING: general, no argument · RPLD: Emergent · Next: take a position + add evidence

**1** *"Garden."*

BEGINNING: does not answer the prompt · RPLD: Foundational · Next: plan claim + reasons

This four-point scale scores the anchor argumentative ECR.

## TEACHER SCRIPT : EXPLAINING THIS TASK TO STUDENTS

**SAY**

"This is your argumentative ECR. State your claim, give reasons with evidence, address the other side, and conclude."

**SAY**

"Make each sentence show stronger thinking. Argue with evidence, not just opinions."

► Give a plan box (claim / reasons / evidence / rebuttal / conclusion). Independent write.

" " = say word-for-word · ► = teacher direction (do not read aloud)